



Canadian Research
Knowledge Network
Réseau canadien
de documentation
pour la recherche

OCUL
Ontario Council of University Libraries

Scholars Portal
A Service of the Ontario Council of University Libraries
Un service du Conseil des bibliothèques universitaires de l'Ontario



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
LIBRARIES

Joint National Journals TDR Task Group

Revised Recommendations – September 9, 2022

Kate Davis – Assistant Director, Scholars Portal

Beth Namachchivaya – University Librarian, University of Waterloo

Craig Olsvik – Senior Manager, Licensing & Member Services, CRKN

Harriet Rykse – Associate Chief Librarian, Western University

Michael Vandenburg – Interim Executive Director, OCUL

The **Joint National Journals TDR Task Group** was formed in 2021 to bring together members of CRKN, OCUL, and Scholars Portal/University of Toronto to reassess, reevaluate, and validate the recommendations that were made to CRKN by the Trusted Digital Repository Task Group (TDRTG) in 2018. In their report, the TDRTG recommended that “CRKN work with OCUL and the University of Toronto Libraries (UTL) to adopt the Scholars Portal TDR as a national TDR service for scholarly resources licensed by CRKN members.” In the time between the filing of the report and the launch of this new task group, CRKN members expressed their support for this collaborative project at several junctures, primarily during CRKN conferences. Nonetheless, as significant time has passed between the filing of the report and recent progress on the project (due to staff turnover, competing priorities, global pandemic, etc.), financial circumstances have no doubt evolved and the cost estimates for the operation of the Scholars Portal Journals platform are no longer accurate. Therefore, in addition to validating and updating the TDRTG recommendations, the task group has also worked to update the financial estimates for the project. The updated recommendations and budget can be presented to members at the CRKN Conference in November 2022 for approval and affirmation to proceed to next steps.

The revised recommendations are specified below, with highlights included to indicate where changes have been made. The original recommendations are included in Appendix A for reference. Recommendations #9 and #10 are new, and cover additional considerations raised by the task group during their review.

1. That CRKN work with OCUL and the University of Toronto Library (UTL) to **adapt** the SP TDR **service** as a national TDR service for scholarly resources licensed by CRKN members.
2. That the transition of the SP TDR from an OCUL-only service to a national service be managed in phases, with details regarding governance to be worked out between CRKN, OCUL and UTL during a transitional phase that would lead ultimately to a shift **to a new governance framework that would be representative of the CRKN membership**.
3. That during the transitional phase, to last no more than three years, a Steering Committee be established by the Board, with representation from CRKN, OCUL and UTL, to oversee the migration of the SP TDR to a national service by developing a memorandum of agreement between all parties regarding governance of the new national service through the transitional phase and into operation.
4. The same Steering Committee shall be charged with developing an initial multi-year budget and cost allocation model for the new national TDR service to be approved **following the establishment of the new governance framework** before the end of the transitional phase.
5. **That CRKN work to adopt Scholars Portal language into its Model License that references the local load agreements between UTL and the content providers.**
6. That CRKN staff begin negotiating for local loading and archiving rights as soon **as the Scholars Portal language has been added to the model license**, and seek to secure these rights for CRKN members from all publishers over the course of the three-year transition phase.
7. That CRKN staff work with SP to integrate CRKN member entitlement information into the TDR service during the transition phase and that the cost of this work be paid for by CRKN on behalf of its members. CRKN should seek agreement with OCUL that, during the transition



Canadian Research Knowledge Network
Réseau canadien de documentation pour la recherche



Ontario Council of University Libraries



A Service of the Ontario Council of University Libraries
Un service du Conseil des bibliothèques universitaires de l'Ontario



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO LIBRARIES

phase, OCUL will pay for all normal operational costs of the TDR as new licenses are negotiated and the service is phased in for CRKN member libraries.

8. That CRKN commit to an **audit/review** of the national SP TDR **and to maintaining trustworthy status through a formal audit process according to best practices in use by preservation community and overseen by its governing body.**
9. **That the Steering Committee struck during the transitional phase shall investigate the potential of adding CRKN-licensed e-books to the resources included in the expanded Scholars Portal, and consider the ramifications therein with respect to including the Books portal in any future inclusion in this project.**
10. **To ensure ongoing sustainability of the Scholars Portal journals platform under a new, expanded CRKN-wide model, it is recommended that the expansion only proceed under an all-in structure, whereby all CRKN members are participating in the financial investment in the platform and benefiting from the services and advantages therein.**

The group has prepared updated modeling for the three-year transition period that was originally envisioned and recommended by the TRDTG. In doing so, the group signals its support of this original recommendation, and emphasizes that this transitional time is useful and necessary as a period that will allow CRKN to negotiate with vendors and publishers to obtain the rights to extend Scholars Portal access to all CRKN members. During this time, Scholars Portal will undertake additional development of its platform and infrastructure in order to accommodate this extended access. The staffing costs for this development work (\$146,000 per annum for three years) will be borne by CRKN members outside of Ontario and will represent the full financial commitment of these CRKN members during this three-year period. Estimates of these annual fees, allocated to each CRKN Band, is presented below, with a full breakdown of institutional allocation provided in appendix B. During this time, members in Ontario will continue to provide the financial support for the direct and indirect operational costs of the Scholars Portal Journals platform via the same process as has historically been in place at OCUL. These costs (using estimates based on the 2021-22 fiscal year), tallied at the OCUL level, are also specified in appendix B.

CRKN Band	Amount
1	N/A – no CRKN members currently in this Band
2	\$217
3	\$319
4	\$470
5	\$693
6	\$1,020
7	\$1,503
8	\$2,213
9	N/A – no CRKN members currently in this Band
10	\$4,800
11	\$7,069
12	\$10,411
13	\$15,333

This Banding scenario was chosen to ensure that CRKN members would be allocated a fair share of the total cost that would be sustainable and relative to the value derived from this project for their institution. At the end of the three-year transition period, CRKN members will have the opportunity to assess the success of the project thus far (particularly the results of negotiations with publishers and correspondingly the amount of CRKN-licensed content that would be accessible and preserved for their institution on Scholars Portal) and another vote of the membership will occur to confirm the shift to the operational phase, where the total operating costs of SP journals will be re-allocated to all CRKN members.



Canadian Research
Knowledge Network
Réseau canadien
de documentation
pour la recherche

OCUL
Ontario Council of University Libraries

Scholars Portal
A Service of the Ontario Council of University Libraries
Un service du Conseil des bibliothèques universitaires de l'Ontario



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
LIBRARIES

Appendix A

The CRKN Trusted Digital Repository Task Group (TDRTG) was mandated by the CRKN Board in 2017 to explore options for the adoption of the Scholars Portal (SP) Trusted Digital Repository (TDR), a service of the Ontario Council of University Libraries (OCUL), as a national TDR service for CRKN. The benefits envisioned would include perpetual access to and digital preservation of scholarly content licensed through CRKN by its member libraries.

Over the last several months, TDRTG members have examined the service model and costs of the current SP TDR service, have assessed issues related to licensing, governance and certification involved in migrating the SP TDR to a national scale, and have consulted widely with the CRKN community and regional consortia and incorporated feedback from those consultations into their recommendations.

Estimates on cost and proposals for cost allocation are provided in the full report below. While based on current data, these should be read as estimates and are offered not prescriptively but to facilitate additional discussion.

The TDRTG believes that this project represents an opportunity for CRKN to leverage existing digital infrastructure to build a national service in a way that will be affordable and will preserve the much larger investment already made by CRKN members in acquiring digital content over the last 17 years. In our consultations across Canada, we have heard much goodwill and eagerness to bring the proposed service to the national level, and encountered no serious impediments to this opportunity that we believe cannot be surmounted.

Recommendations in Brief

The CRKN TDRTG, therefore, respectfully submits the following for consideration by the CRKN Board:

1. That CRKN work with OCUL and the University of Toronto Library (UTL) to adopt the SP TDR as a national TDR service for scholarly resources licensed by CRKN members.
2. That the transition of the SP TDR from an OCUL-only service to a national service be managed in phases, with details regarding governance to be worked out between CRKN, OCUL and UTL during a transitional phase that would lead ultimately to a shift of responsibility for governance of the TDR from OCUL to CRKN in a second operational phase.
3. That during the transitional phase, to last no more than three years, a Steering Committee be established by the Board, with representation from CRKN, OCUL and UTL, to oversee the migration of the SP TDR to a national service by developing a memorandum of agreement between all parties regarding governance of the new national service through the transitional phase and into operation.
4. That the same Steering Committee be charged by the Board with developing an initial three-year budget and cost allocation model for the new national TDR service to be approved by the Board before the end of the transition phase.
5. That CRKN staff work with SP during the transition phase to develop a tri-party model local loading agreement, along the lines of the current OCUL local loading agreement, to be used in negotiations with publishers to secure appropriate rights for CRKN members for perpetual access and archiving through the SP TDR. Parties to the model local load agreement would be CRKN (on behalf of its members), the publisher, and UTL (as the service provider to CRKN for the national SP TDR).



Canadian Research
Knowledge Network
Réseau canadien
de documentation
pour la recherche

OCUL
Ontario Council of University Libraries

 **Scholars Portal**
A Service of the Ontario Council of University Libraries
Un service du Conseil des bibliothèques universitaires de l'Ontario



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
LIBRARIES

6. That CRKN staff begin negotiating for local loading and archiving rights as soon as the model local loading agreement is approved by the Board and seek to secure these rights for CRKN members from all publishers over the course of the three-year transition phase.
7. That CRKN staff work with SP to integrate CRKN member entitlement information into the TDR service during the transition phase and that costs of this work be paid for by CRKN on behalf of its members. CRKN should seek agreement with OCUL that, during the transition phase, OCUL will pay for all normal operational costs of the TDR as new licenses are negotiated and the service is phased in for CRKN member libraries.
8. That CRKN commits to secure the certification of the national SP TDR through formal external audit after the transition of governance from OCUL to CRKN and maintain such certification thereafter by providing regular disclosures to the auditors as required by the TDR certification process.



Canadian Research Knowledge Network
Réseau canadien de documentation pour la recherche



Ontario Council of University Libraries



A Service of the Ontario Council of University Libraries
Un service du Conseil des bibliothèques universitaires de l'Ontario



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO LIBRARIES

Appendix B – Transition Period (per annum)

<i>Canadian Research Knowledge Network Members</i>	<i>SWITCH</i>	<i>Band</i>	<i>Weighted</i>	<i>GeoMild</i>	<i>GeoHigh</i>
<i>76 Participants</i>					
		<i>Total</i>		\$ 146,001.00	\$ 146,006.00
ATLANTIC REGION					
Acadia University	1	6	6	\$ 2,181.00	\$ 1,020.00
Cape Breton University	1	5	5	\$ 1,915.00	\$ 693.00
Dalhousie University	1	10	10	\$ 3,668.00	\$ 4,800.00
Memorial University of Newfoundland	1	10	10	\$ 3,668.00	\$ 4,800.00
Mount Allison University	1	5	5	\$ 1,915.00	\$ 693.00
Mount Saint Vincent University	1	5	5	\$ 1,915.00	\$ 693.00
NSCAD University	1	2	2	\$ 1,297.00	\$ 217.00
Saint Mary's University	1	6	6	\$ 2,181.00	\$ 1,020.00
St. Francis Xavier University	1	6	6	\$ 2,181.00	\$ 1,020.00
Université de Moncton	1	7	7	\$ 2,484.00	\$ 1,503.00
Université Sainte-Anne	1	2	2	\$ 1,297.00	\$ 217.00
University of New Brunswick	1	8	8	\$ 2,829.00	\$ 2,213.00
University of Prince Edward Island	1	6	6	\$ 2,181.00	\$ 1,020.00
13 Total				\$ 29,712.00	\$ 19,909.00
QUEBEC					
Bishop's University	1	4	4	\$ 1,682.00	\$ 470.00
Concordia University	1	10	10	\$ 3,668.00	\$ 4,800.00
École Polytechnique de Montréal	1	8	8	\$ 2,829.00	\$ 2,213.00
HEC Montréal	1	7	7	\$ 2,484.00	\$ 1,503.00
McGill University	1	12	12	\$ 4,757.00	\$ 10,411.00



Canadian Research
Knowledge Network
Réseau canadien
de documentation
pour la recherche

OCUL
Ontario Council of University Libraries

Scholars Portal
A Service of the Ontario Council of University Libraries
Un service du Conseil des bibliothèques universitaires de l'Ontario



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
LIBRARIES

Université de Montréal	1	11	11	\$ 4,178.00	\$ 7,069.00
Université de Sherbrooke	1	10	10	\$ 3,668.00	\$ 4,800.00
Université du Québec:					
École de technologie supérieure	1	7	7	\$ 2,484.00	\$ 1,503.00
École nationale d'administration publique	1	3	3	\$ 1,477.00	\$ 319.00
Institut national de la recherche scientifique	1	5	5	\$ 1,915.00	\$ 693.00
Télé-université du Québec	1	4	4	\$ 1,682.00	\$ 470.00
Université du Québec à Chicoutimi	1	7	7	\$ 2,484.00	\$ 1,503.00
Université du Québec à Montréal	1	10	10	\$ 3,668.00	\$ 4,800.00
Université du Québec à Rimouski	1	6	6	\$ 2,181.00	\$ 1,020.00
Université du Québec à Trois-Rivières	1	8	8	\$ 2,829.00	\$ 2,213.00
Université du Québec en Abitibi-Témiscamingue	1	5	5	\$ 1,915.00	\$ 693.00
Université du Québec en Outaouais	1	6	6	\$ 2,181.00	\$ 1,020.00
Université Laval	1	11	11	\$ 4,178.00	\$ 7,069.00
18 Total				\$ 50,260.00	\$ 52,569.00
ONTARIO					
Algoma University	1	3	3		
Brock University	1	8	8		
Carleton University	1	10	10		
Lakehead University	1	7	7		
Laurentian University	1	8	8		
McMaster University	1	11	11		
Nipissing University	1	5	5		
OCAD University	1	5	5		
Queen's University	1	10	10		
Royal Military College of Canada	1	5	5		
Ryerson University	1	10	10		
Trent University	1	7	7		
University of Guelph	1	10	10		
University of Ontario Institute of Technology	1	7	7		
University of Ottawa	1	11	11		
University of Toronto	1	13	13		
University of Waterloo	1	11	11		
University of Windsor	1	8	8		
Western University	1	11	11		



Canadian Research
Knowledge Network
Réseau canadien
de documentation
pour la recherche

OCUL
Ontario Council of University Libraries

Scholars Portal
A Service of the Ontario Council of University Libraries
Un service du Conseil des bibliothèques universitaires de l'Ontario



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
LIBRARIES

Wilfrid Laurier University	1	8	8		
York University	1	11	11		
21 Total				\$ -	\$ -
WESTERN REGION					
Athabasca University	1	6	6	\$ 2,181.00	\$ 1,020.00
Brandon University	1	5	5	\$ 1,915.00	\$ 693.00
Capilano University	1	4	4	\$ 1,682.00	\$ 470.00
Concordia University of Edmonton	1	3	3	\$ 1,477.00	\$ 319.00
Kwantlen Polytechnic University	1	7	7	\$ 2,484.00	\$ 1,503.00
MacEwan University	1	7	7	\$ 2,484.00	\$ 1,503.00
Mount Royal University	1	7	7	\$ 2,484.00	\$ 1,503.00
Royal Roads University	1	4	4	\$ 1,682.00	\$ 470.00
Simon Fraser University	1	10	10	\$ 3,668.00	\$ 4,800.00
The King's University	1	2	2	\$ 1,297.00	\$ 217.00
Thompson Rivers University	1	7	7	\$ 2,484.00	\$ 1,503.00
Trinity Western University	1	5	5	\$ 1,915.00	\$ 693.00
University of Alberta	1	12	12	\$ 4,757.00	\$ 10,411.00
University of British Columbia	1	13	13	\$ 5,418.00	\$ 15,333.00
University of Calgary	1	12	12	\$ 4,757.00	\$ 10,411.00
University of Lethbridge	1	7	7	\$ 2,484.00	\$ 1,503.00
University of Manitoba	1	10	10	\$ 3,668.00	\$ 4,800.00
University of Northern British Columbia	1	6	6	\$ 2,181.00	\$ 1,020.00
University of Regina	1	8	8	\$ 2,829.00	\$ 2,213.00
University of Saskatchewan	1	10	10	\$ 3,668.00	\$ 4,800.00
University of the Fraser Valley	1	6	6	\$ 2,181.00	\$ 1,020.00
University of Victoria	1	10	10	\$ 3,668.00	\$ 4,800.00
University of Winnipeg	1	7	7	\$ 2,484.00	\$ 1,503.00



Canadian Research
Knowledge Network
Réseau canadien
de documentation
pour la recherche

OCUL
Ontario Council of University Libraries



Scholars Portal
A Service of the Ontario Council of University Libraries
Un service du Conseil des bibliothèques universitaires de l'Ontario



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
LIBRARIES

Vancouver Island University	1	6	6	\$ 2,181.00	\$ 1,020.00
24 Total				\$ 66,029.00	\$ 73,528.00
GRAND TOTAL			378	\$ 146,001.00	\$ 146,006.00

**Annual operational costs for OCUL members are estimated here at the 2021-22 fiscal year level